

Report 2 on the article: 'Impact of a block structure on the Lotka-Volterra model'

Clenet, Massol, Najim

Summary

I believe the authors have made a substantial effort to address my questions and comments thoroughly. The paper is nearly ready for publication, with only a few minor modifications needed, which I have detailed below. After these revisions, the paper could be accepted.

All the best.

Comments

1. Section 3.2: The explanation is still unclear, particularly the sentences "this assumption is part of the heuristics" and "as an argument of the heuristics.". It seems that the authors are assuming that the estimators are converging and that the limits are expressed as $P(x_k > 0 | k \in I_1)$, possibly using intuition from the chaos hypothesis, as mentioned at the beginning of this section. With this, they are able to derive equations (13) and (14). If this interpretation is correct, the authors should clarify this point in their manuscript, perhaps using a similar approach to the one at the beginning of Section 3.2, where they write, "We assume that asymptotically the x 's are independent from the B_{kl} 's, an assumption supported by the chaos hypothesis."
2. Heuristics (13)-(14) p.12: $<$ should be $>$.
3. p.30 "using RMT theory": please give a precise reference.
4. Section C.3: I have the impression that the λ_i 's should not be there.